Bush plans to screen whole US population for mental illness -- Lenzer 328 (7454): 1458 -- BMJ

News

Bush plans to screen whole US population for mental illness

Jeanne Lenzer

New York

A sweeping mental health initiative will be unveiled by President George W Bush in July. The plan promises to integrate mentally ill patients fully into the community by providing "services in the community, rather than institutions," according to a March 2004 progress report entitled New Freedom Initiative (www.whitehouse.gov/infocus/newfreedom/toc-2004.html). While some praise the plan's goals, others say it protects the profits of drug companies at the expense of the public.

Bush established the New Freedom Commission on Mental Health in April 2002 to conduct a "comprehensive study of the United States mental health service delivery system." The commission issued its recommendations in July 2003. Bush instructed more than 25 federal agencies to develop an implementation plan based on those recommendations.

The president's commission found that "despite their prevalence, mental disorders often go undiagnosed" and recommended comprehensive mental health screening for "consumers of all ages," including preschool children. According to the commission, "Each year, young children are expelled from preschools and childcare facilities for severely disruptive behaviours and emotional disorders." Schools, wrote the commission, are in a "key position" to screen the 52 million students and 6 million adults who work at the schools.

The commission also recommended "Linkage [of screening] with treatment and supports" including "state-of-the-art treatments" using "specific medications for specific conditions." The commission commended the Texas Medication Algorithm Project (TMAP) as a "model" medication treatment plan that "illustrates an evidence-based practice that results in better consumer outcomes."

Dr Darrel Regier, director of research at the American Psychiatric Association (APA), lauded the president's initiative and the Texas project model saying, "What's nice about TMAP is that this is a logical plan based on efficacy data from clinical trials."

He said the association has called for increased funding for implementation of the overall plan.

But the Texas project, which promotes the use of newer, more expensive antidepressants and antipsychotic drugs, sparked off controversy when Allen Jones, an employee of the Pennsylvania Office of the Inspector General, revealed that key officials with influence over the medication plan in his state received money and perks from drug companies with a stake in the medication algorithm (15 May, p1153). He was sacked this week for speaking to the BMJ and the New York Times.

The Texas project started in 1995 as an alliance of individuals from the pharmaceutical industry, the University of Texas, and the mental health and corrections systems of Texas. The project was funded by a Robert Wood Johnson grant—and by several drug companies.

Mr Jones told the BMJ that the same "political/pharmaceutical alliance" that generated the Texas project was behind the recommendations of the New Freedom Commission, which, according to his whistleblower report, were "poised to consolidate the TMAP effort into a comprehensive national policy to treat mental illness with expensive, patented medications of questionable benefit and deadly side effects, and to force private insurers to pick up more of the tab" (http://psychrights.org/Drugs/AllenJonesTMAPJanuary20.pdf).

Larry D Sasich, research associate with Public Citizen in Washington, DC, told the BMJ that studies in both the United States and Great Britain suggest that "using the older drugs first makes sense. There's nothing in the labeling of the newer atypical antipsychotic drugs that suggests they are superior in efficacy to haloperidol [an older "typical" antipsychotic]. There has to be an enormous amount of unnecessary expenditures for the newer drugs."

Olanzapine (trade name Zyprexa), one of the atypical antipsychotic drugs recommended as a first line drug in the Texas algorithm, grossed $4.28bn (£2.35bn; €3.56bn) worldwide in 2003 and is Eli Lilly's top selling drug. A 2003 New York Times article by Gardiner Harris reported that 70% of olanzapine sales are paid for by government agencies, such as Medicare and Medicaid.

Eli Lilly, manufacturer of olanzapine, has multiple ties to the Bush administration. George Bush Sr was a member of Lilly's board of directors and Bush Jr appointed Lilly's chief executive officer, Sidney Taurel, to a seat on the Board of Directors of the Federal Trade Commission when he was in office.
Drug companies have contributed three times more to the campaign of George Bush, seen here campaigning in Florida, than to that of his rival John Kerry.

Credit: GERALD HERBERT/AP

Bush plans to screen whole US population for mental illness -- Lenzer 328 (7454): 1458 -- BMJ

Bush plans to screen whole US population for mental illness: Is road of initiative paved with good intentions?
Woody Caan
BMJ 2004 329: 292. [Extract] [Full Text]

Bush plans to screen whole US population for mental illness: An unlikely public healthcare initiative
John R Broomfield
BMJ 2004 329: 292. [Extract] [Full Text]

Bush plans to screen whole US population for mental illness: Bush’s sanity test is revealed
Archie W Julien
BMJ 2004 329: 292. [Extract] [Full Text]

Bush plans to screen whole US population for mental illness: Summary of responses

Bush was the governor of Texas during the development of the Texas project, and, during his 2000 presidential campaign, he boasted of his support for the project and the fact that the legislation he passed expanded Medicaid coverage of psychotropic drugs.

Bush is the clear front runner when it comes to drug company contributions. According to the Center for Responsive Politics (CRP), manufacturers of drugs and health products have contributed $764 274 to the 2004 Bush campaign through their political action committees and employees—far outstripping the $149 400 given to his chief rival, John Kerry, by 26 April.

Drug companies have fared exceedingly well under the Bush administration, according to the centre's spokesperson, Steven Weiss.

The commission's recommendation for increased screening has also been questioned. Robert Whitaker, journalist and author of Mad in America, says that while increased screening "may seem defensible," it could also be seen as "fishing for customers," and that exorbitant spending on new drugs "robs from other forms of care such as job training and shelter programmes."

But Dr Graham Emslie, who helped develop the Texas project, defends screening: "There are good data showing that if you identify kids at an earlier age who are aggressive, you can intervene... and change their trajectory."

Related Articles

US teenager's parents sue school over depression screening test
Jeanne Lenzer
BMJ 2005 331: 714. [Extract] [Full Text]

Bush unveils mental health action plan
Jeanne Lenzer
BMJ 2005 331: 592. [Extract] [Full Text]

Bush's plan to screen for mental health meets opposition in Illinois
Jeanne Lenzer
BMJ 2004 329: 1065. [Extract] [Full Text]

Bush launches controversial mental health plan
Jeanne Lenzer
BMJ 2004 329: 367. [Extract] [Full Text]

Bush plans to screen whole US population for mental illness: Is road of initiative paved with good intentions?
Woody Caan
BMJ 2004 329: 292. [Extract] [Full Text]

Bush plans to screen whole US population for mental illness: An unlikely public healthcare initiative
John R Broomfield
BMJ 2004 329: 292. [Extract] [Full Text]

Bush plans to screen whole US population for mental illness: Bush’s sanity test is revealed
Archie W Julien
BMJ 2004 329: 292. [Extract] [Full Text]

Bush plans to screen whole US population for mental illness: Summary of responses
FDA's counsel accused of being too close to drug industry
Jeanne Lenzer
BMJ 2004 329: 189. [Extract] [Full Text]

Whistleblower charges medical oversight bureau with corruption
Jeanne Lenzer
BMJ 2004 329: 69. [Extract] [Full Text]

Whistleblower removed from job for talking to the press
Jeanne Lenzer
BMJ 2004 328: 1153. [Extract] [Full Text]

Rapid Responses:
Read all Rapid Responses

After this mass screening they are planning to use the lie-detector
Dr. Herbert H. Nehrlich
bmj.com, 17 Jun 2004 [Full text]

Welcome.
Jim Sane
bmj.com, 18 Jun 2004 [Full text]

A public health project worthy of massive public funding provided the aim is not to screen for "mental illnesses".
Richard G Fiddian-Green
bmj.com, 20 Jun 2004 [Full text]

Any other sources of information for the article?
Richard M Diamond
bmj.com, 20 Jun 2004 [Full text]

We must be crazy...
Michael Ellner
bmj.com, 20 Jun 2004 [Full text]

Paved with good intentions?
Woody Caan
bmj.com, 20 Jun 2004 [Full text]

Instruments for Screening and Treatment Modalities
Eileen McGinn
bmj.com, 20 Jun 2004 [Full text]

Ambitious yet commendable
Prem K Kunjukrishnan, et al.
bmj.com, 20 Jun 2004 [Full text]

Bush plans to screen whole US population for mental illness
Raymond Gallup
bmj.com, 20 Jun 2004 [Full text]

Bush's Sanity Test Revealed
Dr. Archie W. Julien
WATCH OUT for Bush push of psychiatric drugs
David W. Oaks
bmj.com, 20 Jun 2004 [Full text]

Brave new world?
Blue Pilgrim
bmj.com, 20 Jun 2004 [Full text]

WE NEED A FORUM?
D.Michael VAN DE VEER, et al.
bmj.com, 20 Jun 2004 [Full text]

Implications of Government Sponsored Mental Health Screenings: Some Important Questions
Barbara Rubin
bmj.com, 20 Jun 2004 [Full text]

Psychotic in Texas
Mark Struthers
bmj.com, 20 Jun 2004 [Full text]

Awareness = Paranoia
Darcy R Baston
bmj.com, 21 Jun 2004 [Full text]

Re: Bush's Sanity Test Revealed
Dr. Naseem A. Qureshi
bmj.com, 21 Jun 2004 [Full text]

Goals of Screening?
Judith A. Wills
bmj.com, 21 Jun 2004 [Full text]

Big Pharma Knows How to Create A Market
Dr. Toby Tyler Watson
bmj.com, 21 Jun 2004 [Full text]

Its the Bush cabal who need testing .. ASAP
David Broatch
bmj.com, 21 Jun 2004 [Full text]

Sources for article
Jeanne M. Lenzer
bmj.com, 21 Jun 2004 [Full text]

Bush Back on Clinton Agenda Again?
Fritz E. Cluzen
bmj.com, 21 Jun 2004 [Full text]

From the perspective of a consumer
Elaine H Menard
bmj.com, 22 Jun 2004 [Full text]

Delusional belief in your own intelligence?
Sam Line
bmj.com, 22 Jun 2004 [Full text]

Please Bush don't do this it is wrong!
Mental Health Begins at Home
Carol Davidek-Waller
bmj.com, 22 Jun 2004 [Full text]

I think Mr. Bush ought to start with the White House and other governmental branches.
AK Al-Sheikhli
bmj.com, 22 Jun 2004 [Full text]

Bush’s Defense from an Autism Parent
Lisa N. Neal, et al.
bmj.com, 22 Jun 2004 [Full text]

why would anyone trust bush?
J T Temple
bmj.com, 23 Jun 2004 [Full text]

Long live the Nutty Professor
Dr. Herbert H. Nehrlich
bmj.com, 23 Jun 2004 [Full text]

Does Kerry know this?
Howard Minor
bmj.com, 23 Jun 2004 [Full text]

Re: Any other sources of information for the article?
Helena Rocca
bmj.com, 23 Jun 2004 [Full text]

Weapons cartel to drug cartel: Bush administration’s top trajectories.
Dr. Naseem A. Qureshi, MD, IMAPA, LMIPS
bmj.com, 24 Jun 2004 [Full text]

Re: Long live the Nutty Professor
John P Heptonstall
bmj.com, 24 Jun 2004 [Full text]

Fascism by any other name?
Dr. Herbert H. Nehrlich
bmj.com, 24 Jun 2004 [Full text]

An unlikely public healthcare initiative
John R. Broomfield
bmj.com, 24 Jun 2004 [Full text]

Mens sana in corpore sano
Dr. Herbert H. Nehrlich
bmj.com, 25 Jun 2004 [Full text]

In response to this initiative.
Tim Lassiter
bmj.com, 24 Jun 2004 [Full text]

The first step in fighting the illness is admitting the problem
Dr. Archie W. Julien
bmj.com, 29 Jun 2004 [Full text]

http://www.bmj.com/cgi/content/full/328/7454/1458
Bush plans to screen whole US population for mental illness -- Lenzer 328 (7454): 1458 -- BMJ

Bush's Psychopharmacetic Inquisition
Nathaniel S. Lehrman, M.D.
bmj.com, 26 Jun 2004 [Full text]

Good Sense can Prevail
Louise Mclean
bmj.com, 26 Jun 2004 [Full text]

Re: Re: Any other sources of information for the article?
Sepp Hasslberger
bmj.com, 29 Jun 2004 [Full text]

Bush Not Alone in Promoting Questionable Population-Based Health Screenings
Laura Newman
bmj.com, 27 Jun 2004 [Full text]

When screening can be more cost-effective for mental illness?
Y Adi
bmj.com, 29 Jun 2004 [Full text]

Screening & treatment for mental health: a society addicted to drugs?
Giulio Formoso, et al.
bmj.com, 29 Jun 2004 [Full text]

Mental Health Screening - and what will be next?
Marilyn L. Zack
bmj.com, 29 Jun 2004 [Full text]

At what cost...
Jessica Epure
bmj.com, 30 Jun 2004 [Full text]

Re: When screening can be more cost-effective for mental illness?
David Horowitz
bmj.com, 30 Jun 2004 [Full text]

Re: At what cost...
Joan T McClusky
bmj.com, 2 Jul 2004 [Full text]

Personal Perspective
Monica Jackson
bmj.com, 5 Jul 2004 [Full text]

Re: Re: When screening can be more cost-effective for mental illness?
John R Sparkes
bmj.com, 6 Jul 2004 [Full text]

Any way to prevent or limit this atrocity?
lindsay geddes
bmj.com, 11 Jul 2004 [Full text]

Re: WATCH OUT for Bush push of psychiatric drugs
Kathleen (Katie) M. Hill
bmj.com, 11 Jul 2004 [Full text]

Even ill intentions can have good results
Michael F. Heilman, et al.
bmj.com, 12 Jul 2004 [Full text]

http://www.bmj.com/cgi/content/full/328/7454/1458
Re: Even ill intentions can have good results
John P Heptonstall
bmj.com, 12 Jul 2004 [Full text]

Re: Even ill intentions can have good results
Barbara R. Rubin
bmj.com, 13 Jul 2004 [Full text]

Identifying Americans in need of mental-health screenings
Michael J Reynolds
bmj.com, 14 Jul 2004 [Full text]

Re: Re: Even ill intentions can have good results
MC Feliciello
bmj.com, 14 Jul 2004 [Full text]

A development of real concern...
Charly Groenendijk
bmj.com, 19 Jul 2004 [Full text]

It is happening now
Allen L. Jones, et al.
bmj.com, 24 Jul 2004 [Full text]

Mothers need gentle birth and nutrition, not drugs!!!
Jenny M Hatch
bmj.com, 25 Jul 2004 [Full text]

Mr Bush's plan is not good.
David N. Andrews
bmj.com, 26 Jul 2004 [Full text]

Medication for Mental Illness - Cure or Cause?
Debby Painter
bmj.com, 30 Jul 2004 [Full text]

Begging the Question of Mental "Illness"
F. Breckenridge McKinley
bmj.com, 30 Jul 2004 [Full text]

BUSH PLANS TO SCREEN WHOLE U.S. POPULATION FOR MENTAL ILLNESS
Hayley H Szeto
bmj.com, 1 Aug 2004 [Full text]

Alarming but FALSE Headline
Sarah A Koch
bmj.com, 11 Aug 2004 [Full text]

Don't worry, be happy!
Dr. Herbert H. Nehrlich
bmj.com, 12 Aug 2004 [Full text]

Re: Awareness = Paranoia
Mary Powers, et al.
bmj.com, 31 Aug 2004 [Full text]

The American Psychiatric Association worked to suppress dissemination of this report
Denise D Dewald
bmj.com, 8 Sep 2004 [Full text]
Bush plans to screen whole US population for mental illness -- Lenzer 328 (7454): 1458 -- BMJ

Re: Any other sources of information for the article?
melissa d martinez
bmj.com, 26 Nov 2004 [Full text]

Re: It is happening now
Brenda Durant
bmj.com, 28 Nov 2004 [Full text]

Re: Bush plans to screen whole US population for mental illness
Lauren J Sullivan
bmj.com, 2 Jan 2005 [Full text]

Nationwide Screening for Teens Already in Place
Susan Weibert
bmj.com, 28 Jan 2005 [Full text]